FILED

Oct 15, 2024

Mark B. Busby CLERK, U.S. DISTRICT COURT NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA OAKLAND

Case Name: Katz-Lacabe et al v. Oracle America, Inc.,

Case number: 3:22-cv-04792-RS

I, Vadim Epelbaum, believe that I am a Settlement Class Member because, like most Americans, I have utilized various smartphones to accomplish a wide range of tasks since 2018. These include, but are not limited to: web browsing, online shopping, location and navigation services, as well as email, among others.

My contact information is as follows. Though I humbly request that the court redact this and any personal information contained herein, should my objection be made publically available.

Full Name: Vadim Epelbaum

Email: Vadim.deals@gmail.com

Mailing Address: 1905 Sherman St.

#200 1053

Denver, CO 80203

My reason for objecting to the proposed settlement is that Oracle America, Inc., like most companies that collect and sell data, earns billions of dollars from such practices. According to Maximize Market Research, companies that broker user data earned over \$252 billion (USD), in 2023 alone. Even if Oracle only earned one-half of one percent of this amount, it would still exceed \$1.2 billion annually. Thus, it would be safe to say that, since 2018, Oracle America, Inc has reaped between \$6 billion and \$10 billion from this practice.

Consequently, the proposed \$115 million settlement would be akin to a bank-robber having to pay a \$10,000 and promising never to rob a bank again, after he stole \$10 million! In other words, if Oracle must pay 1% of their ill-gotten-gains to make this all go away, why on Earth would they not just do it again?

This settlement will realistically result in a multi-million dollar payout to the attorneys, a clean slate for the offenders, and maybe a cup of coffee for each of the millions of Americans who now have their personal information being sold and traded. Keep in mind, that the information in question may have been sold for marketing and targeting purposes, but Oracle has no control over where it goes from there. It may have also been sold or resold to scammers and criminals who are now utilizing it to target vulnerable segments of the population, and rob them of their life's savings. Thus, if this is the recourse that the American people get, then this is not a system of justice, but that of criminal pandering.

P.10/2

At the very least, a discovery of Oracle America, Inc, should make public their earnings from such practices. Moreover, the settlement should cover at least 5 years of data removal services, such as Incogni or a host of others, which will scrub the web and advocate on the consumers' behalf to have personal data removed from lists and websites.

I appreciate your time and consideration of my objection to the settlement. Unfortunately, I will not be available to appear for the Final Approval Hearing. However, I look forward to hearing about the decision and am hopeful that there is still some justice in the country for which I fought.

Sincerely,

Vadim Epelbaum



